



MEETING MINUTES

HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING HUMAN RESOURCES PINNACLE TRAINING ROOM 7575 EAST MAIN STREET SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA DECEMBER 12, 2005

- PRESENT:** John Tutelman, Chairman
Marty Gendron, Commissioner
Carol Padwe, Commissioner (arrived 5:21 p.m.)
Enid Seiden, Commissioner
Aubrey Strickstein, Commissioner (arrived 5:22 p.m.)
Theodore Tyler, Commissioner
- ABSENT:** Michèle TaTiana deLaFreniere, Vice-Chairman (on Vacation)
- STAFF PRESENT:** Don Logan, Office of Diversity & Dialogue
- APPLICANT:** Michele Borie, School Administrator of International School of Arizona

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The regular meeting of the Scottsdale Human Relations Commission was called to order by Chairman Tutelman at 5:07 p.m. A formal roll call confirmed the members present as stated above.

2. **REVIEW OF MINUTES**

COMMISSIONER GENDRON MADE A MOTION TO ACCEPT THE MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER 24, 2005 MEETING. COMMISSIONER TYLER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY BY A VOTE OF 4 (FOUR TO 0 (ZERO)).

3. **PROMOTING UNITY IN THE COMMUNITY:**

Commission will consider approval of a grant application from the International School of Arizona's unity and diversity program. The

applicant will be available to respond to any questions the Commission may have relative to its application.

Chairman Tutelman introduced Michele Borie, School Administrator from the International School of Arizona, who had submitted an application for a grant.

Mr. Logan clarified that the event had taken place on November 12. The application was submitted to the Commission prior to the date for the last Commission meeting, which was canceled. One of the requirements of the program is that the application be for an event that is yet to occur. The application would fall under the guidelines, had the Commission meeting not been canceled.

At the invitation of Chairman Tutelman, Ms. Borie talked about the International School and the program. The school is a private pre-school and elementary program for children aged 2 through 10, offering immersion programs in both French and Spanish. The school promotes intercultural understanding, specifically through language.

In the Valley, opportunities to be exposed to other languages or learn them are primarily geared to adults. The school wanted to make children aware of other languages. For the students, including French students from Chaparral High School, the program was an opportunity to use their language learning outside of the classroom. Fifteen children aged 5 to 17 read poems in French and Spanish to an audience of about 70.

Most of the children at the school are from American families, who believe in teaching a second language at an early age. One-third of the children have one francophone parent. One-third of the children come from American families where no second language is spoken. The remaining third are a mix of international families.

NOTING THAT THE COMMISSION MISSED ITS NOVEMBER MEETING THROUGH NO FAULT OF THE INTERNATIONAL SCHOOL, COMMISSIONER GENDRON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE POST FACTO DISPENSING THE FUNDS.

Chairman Tutelman noted that the Commission had made the rule that the approval had to occur before the event.

THE MOTION WAS SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER STRICKSTEIN.

In response to comments by Commissioner Padwe, Commissioners Gendron and Seiden commented that the flyer distributed by the Commission did not specify that City funds should not be used for private schools.

Commissioner Padwe opined that this program is not something that she would want to give financial support to, noting that the Cave Creek School District has Spanish immersion starting in first grade. She questioned how this program promoted unity and diversity.

Chairman Tutelman clarified that the funding would be for the event, which was open to the public. Referring to the criteria of the program, Chairman Tutelman noted that the event must be one that promotes diversity. This was a special event that was open to the public.

Commissioner Tyler said that he is personally unable to draw a distinction between the regular school curriculum and the event.

In response to inquiry by Commissioner Gendron, Ms. Borie confirmed that the public attended.

Commissioner Seiden opined that reading doesn't really promote diversity and asked if anything else contributed to sharing the culture. Ms. Borie replied that the refreshments that they offered at this event were planned to introduce culture through food and expose people to something different.

Commissioner Strickstein opined that there is something about hearing something in another language; Just hearing another language spoken is a dialogue and a sharing of culture.

In response to inquiry by Commissioner Padwe regarding newspaper coverage, Ms. Borie reported that the event was announced in the Arizona Republic and that after the event a piece appeared in the education section of azcentral.com under private schools.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF 4 (FOUR) TO 2 (TWO), WITH COMMISSIONERS TYLER AND PADWE DISSENTING.

Ms. Borie thanked the Commission. She said that the school hopes to make this an annual event. Children learning a foreign language need opportunities to make use of their learning. The school has a number of after hours programs and summer camps for children who want to learn another language.

Commissioner Gendron asked Ms. Borie to let the Commission know when they have another event in the future. He would like to attend and the Commission would help promote the event.

4. **REGIONAL HRC DAY LABORER SUBCOMMITTEE UPDATE:**
Commissioner Gendron will provide an update to SHRC concerning the Regional HRC Day Laborer Forums planned in the Valley. This discussion includes, but is not limited to answering and asking questions and providing explanation for clarification.

Commissioner Gendron reported that he attended the Attorney General's conference, but this event did not really address the day labor issue. The next meeting of the subcommittee will be early in the New Year in order to set a February date for the next forum.

He added that a number of articles have appeared in the media. Some confrontations and demonstrations have taken place on Arizona Avenue

In response to inquiry by Commissioner Gendron regarding the overall direction of this issue, Commissioner Gendron replied that the subcommittee is trying to find common ground. They want to solve the problem of day laborers blocking the street, which they hope will be resolved by provision of a Day Labor Center.

Mr. Logan remarked that on the political front, there is a feeling that this is not an issue in Scottsdale. With the pending opening next spring of Lowe's Home Improvement Center, it is just a matter of time before these issues surface in the City. City staff working with Lowe's have been urged to deal with this concern strategically before it becomes a problem.

Commissioner Seiden asked whether something could be built where day laborers could go rather than just being on the street. Chairman Tutelman said state legislation prohibits cities and counties from spending any funds to build day labor centers.

Commissioner Gendron suggested that maybe an approach might be made to faith-based organizations to see whether there might be an interested ministry. Mr. Logan said that staff are researching an agency that has been addressing this issue in this particular area. Staff learned this information late last month and are trying to gather more information about it.

Chairman Tutelman commented that Lowe's will certainly have a vested interest in this. Commissioner Gendron noted that in other communities Lowe's has been supportive in this matter in other communities.

5. **CROSS CULTURAL COMMUNICATION SERIES:**
Commissioners will review and discuss the outcome of the November workshop, which was the second of four planned for the 2005-2006 Cross Cultural Communication Series.

Mr. Logan reported that capacity crowds attended both sessions on Lessons From The Holocaust, which took place in November. The first was a noon hour session. A couple of attendees were disruptive and were asked to leave. The police had to be summoned.

The second session was so full that people had to be turned away. The two individuals who had disrupted the first session returned and were greeted by uniformed police. At future Cross-Cultural Communications sessions there will be a police presence. Evaluations of the session were overwhelmingly positive. The presenter shared her experiences as a survivor of the Holocaust.

Commissioner Gendron said the disrupters were obviously prepared to discredit the presenter and dispute the facts of the Holocaust. This has been going on for a number of years. The two individuals refused to give their names.

Commissioner Padwe noted that Mr. Logan handled the situation with finesse and without losing his temper. It was an excellent presentation at which the speaker mostly spoke on the work she does with at-risk youth.

Mr. Logan opined that she is a marvelous lady with a wonderful story to tell. It was a wonderful educational opportunity. It was unfortunate that students had to be turned away because of lack of space. Staff are considering asking the speaker back next year.

Commissioner Gendron noted that the Mayor's breakfast might be an appropriate forum for this speaker.

Chairman Tutelman reminded the Commission that the next session in the series is on Tuesday, March 21, 2006 at noon at the Performing Arts Center Outdoor Amphitheater. The topic is: Tonga, the Last Kingdom of the Polynesian Islands.

Commissioner Gendron noticed some home schooled children in attendance. Publicizing the sessions to the local association of home schoolers would be a good idea, since the sessions are such a great educational opportunity.

6. **REVIEW OF COMMISSION'S PURPOSE, POWERS, & DUTIES:**

Commissioners will assess whether the current Scottsdale Review Code provisions accurately reflect the work currently done by the Commission. This discussion includes, but is not limited to answering and asking questions and providing explanation for clarification.

Mr. Logan addressed the Commission, reporting that he, along with the staff liaisons to other City boards and commissions, have been asked to bring this information forward to their respective Commissions to review the Commission's purpose, powers, and duties. Any recommendations for change would be forwarded to the City Council. Attached to the handout is a copy of the Commission's purpose, powers, and duties. The Commission is asked to assess whether that information is consistent with the Scottsdale Revised Code and if not, what recommendations need to be made to the City Council. Commissioners have an excerpt from the Scottsdale Revised Code that identifies the powers of the Commission.

Commissioner Tyler asked whether there are any differences from the previous Code. Mr. Logan replied that the Human Relations Commission was established in 2000. The language used to establish the Commission has not changed.

Commissioner Gendron said that while he has been a Commissioner, the Commission has done some informal investigations. Nothing in the document actually gives the Commission the authority to conduct formal or informal hearings and make recommendations to City Council. This is a question the Commission might discuss. A discussion ensued on past proceedings of the Commission.

Chairman Tutelman said his interpretation of the document is that the Commission's duties are to make recommendations on ways to encourage mutual respect and understanding among people, to discourage prejudice and discrimination, and to work towards cultural awareness and unity. He would think that conducting hearings and making recommendations to City Council might fit under the second function of discouraging prejudice and discrimination.

Mr. Logan added that the fact that this language of discouraging prejudice and discrimination is included, gives the Commission the legal authority to inquire of staff with regard to investigations and informal hearings. Those that come to mind specific to the Police Department include the psychological testing standards that are used by police. He believes that the language that is there gives the Commission the legal ability to call for these hearings.

Commissioner Gendron can accept that the Commission ought to have something in the language allowing it to receive complaints, if necessary. The Commission should not be the sole recipient of complaints, since the Office of Diversity and Dialogue also has that function.

Commissioner Tyler said that might be construed as taking away some function from the Office of Diversity and Dialogue. The Commission has discussed the respective roles of the Office of Diversity and Dialogue and its own role in the past. It has been said that the Office of Diversity and Dialogue deals with complaints from citizens who have been impacted in some way by a City agency. The Human Relations Commission has a broader role to accept complaints throughout the City that may not be related to City of Scottsdale agencies.

Commissioner Padwe questioned whether the Commission has jurisdiction over the School District since it is supposed to advise the City Council and the Mayor, who have no jurisdiction over the School District.

A discussion ensued on the role of the Commission. Commissioner Strickstein sees the Commission as a place where people can bring questions or concerns, as long as it is within Scottsdale.

Chairman Tutelman suggested that the Commission is both complementary and supplementary to the Office of Diversity and Dialogue. The Commission represents the citizens of Scottsdale and the Office of Diversity and Dialogue represents the City of Scottsdale government. He believes that the Commission's mandate is to discourage prejudice and discrimination, which is a very broad mandate. The Commission can use any legal tools at its disposal to fulfill its mandate.

Mr. Logan sees that the Office of Diversity and Dialogue serves as a conduit to the Commission to work with City departments to address issues. Every hearing the Commission has conducted has come to it through the Office of Diversity and Dialogue. The intent of the language in the Code was not to be limiting. He assured the Commission that his office would not turn away a complaint related to the School District. Rather, they would be a referral agency for them. If it is not related to a specific City of Scottsdale function the office is limited, but still has a responsibility to act.

A discussion ensued on what is meant by City of Scottsdale in terms of the functions of the Commission. Mr. Logan said that the reason for the establishment of the Human Relations Commission was that staff recognized that there may be people in the community who would probably feel more comfortable addressing their issues in a public setting. The establishment of the

Commission was intended to create another resource in addition to the Office of Diversity and Dialogue.

Commissioner Strickstein said that he has always had a concern that the Commission is not fully representative of the population of Scottsdale. He felt that the Commission should actively recruit people from diverse backgrounds. Chairman Tutelman commented that the Commission does not have direct control over this, since Council appoints the Commissioners. However the Commission could start to recruit applicants through some type of affirmative action program to recruit a more diverse Commission as terms expire.

Remarking that he would hate to see the Commission beat itself up over this topic, Mr. Logan recalled that this had once been the most diverse commission in the City, in terms of ethnicity. It is always a challenge to recruit a diverse composition of volunteers that reflect the community. He reminded the meeting that the population of Scottsdale is 93.6 percent white. He was encouraged by the fact that they were looking beyond the skin color. That is the message in terms of communicating to the greater organization. Martin Luther King would not have been successful if he had only surrounded himself with people like himself.

Mr. Logan said that Council interview applicants. He suggested that the Commission recruit diverse candidates who would be interested in serving and then lobby Councilmen. Commissioner Seiden suggested that the Commission make Council aware that the Commission would like to become as much of a representative body as possible.

Chairman Tutelman said that vacancies can be publicized to organizations with diverse membership to encourage more diverse applications to the Commission. The Commission needs to think about what action needs to be taken to fulfill this mandate.

Mr. Logan said that if the Commission has recommendations with regard to the language in the Code he would take those to the City Manager's office.

After a short discussion, Chairman Tutelman declared a recess.

7. **CHAIRMAN REPORTS:**
The Chair of the SHRC will update the SHRC on the status of current events and activities of the Human Relations Commission including, but not limited to, upcoming events, current issues, and program highlights, including correspondence received or sent since the last commission meeting.

Chairman Tutelman noted nothing to report.

8. **COMMISSIONER ITEMS:**
Commissioners will update the SHRC and staff on the status of current events and activities of Human Relations Commission including, but not limited to upcoming events, current issues, and program highlights, including correspondence received since the last Commission meeting.

Commissioner Padwe talked about One Scottsdale, which is a group that was formed by Bruce Johnson, Pastor of Scottsdale Presbyterian Church. The group is trying to unify citizens and have one agenda, rather than the north Scottsdale agenda and the south Scottsdale agenda.

She and Commissioner Tyler attended a meeting addressing the issue of affordable housing. It is known that policemen, firefighters and teachers cannot afford to live in Scottsdale. The director of Planning for the City told the meeting he has 12 vacancies, but that a well qualified applicant from out of state had to refuse a job offer because he could not find affordable housing.

Professor Michael Pitock of the ASU Architecture Department spoke at the meeting. He is an expert in affordable housing and has a private architectural firm. With no mass transit, there is a need for workforce housing. The issues are well known but there is a need to get started on the solutions. They want a partnership between the banks, the government, the City, and businesses. The professor talked about having mixed use on Scottsdale Road, with stores on the ground level and apartments upstairs.

The professor identified a need for 10,000 units a year of workforce housing in Maricopa County. Currently 1,800 units are being built each year. He said that the citizens of Scottsdale must accept higher density and there must be a change in the attitudes of public officials and regulators. He said that affordable housing is not welfare. The City should not have to raise salaries to get workers. Commissioner Padwe encouraged Commissioners to attend the One Scottsdale meetings in future.

Commissioner Tyler added that most of the speaker's work has been in California where affordable workforce housing is mandated. He told the meeting that such initiatives in Arizona would have to be voluntary.

Chairman Tutelman asked Commissioner Seiden for an update on the Unity Walk. She has not heard from anyone. Mr. Logan had a call that day from the City of Phoenix. It will be on February 4th at Indian Steele Park in Phoenix. A meeting is scheduled for December 14th, which he plans to attend. The walk will likely being at 9:00 a.m.

Commissioner Seiden mentioned that an article about her and her husband appeared in the 101 North Magazine and was written to promote the chef. She does not feel that the article reflects who she truly is.

Commissioner Tyler said all Commission Members should have received invitations to the MLK event, which will take place on January 9, 2006 at the Chaparral Suites Hotel. This year the organizers solicited all of the school districts whose students may be Scottsdale residents. This was a very conscious effort and representatives from outside the Scottsdale School District will be attending. All private schools have also been solicited.

Commissioner Gendron volunteered to be on the committee or group working with Lowe's on the day labor issue. He told the group that there are some

interesting groups in Scottsdale with very limited viewpoints on immigration and immigration reform. He and Commissioner Padwe attended the Annual Restart Meeting for DLA. The meeting was very well attended.

Commissioner Gendron asked whether there will be any student discounts for the MLK dinner. Mr. Logan said the Board has not yet had an opportunity to discuss that issue. The Youth Voices event is free. Julian Bond, the keynote speaker, will meet the students. The format this year is changed and a gospel choir will be performing. A 13-year-old student will recite Dr. King's Mountaintop speech. Jesse Maguire will sing and Eddy Johnson's daughter is going to sing the National Anthem. High school service learning students are volunteering. Commissioner Gendron volunteered that his adult sociology students could also help if there is a need.

9. **OPEN CALL TO THE PUBLIC** (A.R.S. § 38-431.02)

Subject to reasonable time, place and manner restrictions, as determined by the Chairman, members of the public will be allowed to address the Human Relations Commission on any issue within the jurisdiction of the Commission.

None

10. **STAFF LIAISON ITEMS:**

Staff Liaison will update SHRC on the status of requested presentations, upcoming events, current issues, and program highlights, as well as any correspondence received since the last Commission meeting. Commissioners will review and discuss information presented and make decisions accordingly.

Mr. Logan reported that Holiday Harmony was well attended. His office had a booth that distributed information about the different City programs. The Sharing the Season document was popular. This document explains what the different religious beliefs are that are celebrated during the holidays.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:06 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
A/V Tronics, Inc.